

J·D·H·L·S

Journal of D. H. Lawrence Studies

Citation details

Review of: Susan Reid, *D. H. Lawrence, Music and Modernism*.
Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.

Author: Bethan Jones

Source: *Journal of the D. H. Lawrence Society*, vol. 5.2 (2019)

Pages: 181–5

Copyright: individual author and the D. H. Lawrence Society.
Quotations from Lawrence's works © The Estate of Frieda
Lawrence Ravagli. Extracts and poems from various publications
by D. H. Lawrence reprinted by permission of Pollinger Limited
(www.pollingerltd.com) on behalf of the Estate of Frieda Lawrence
Ravagli.

A Publication of the
D. H. Lawrence Society of Great Britain

Theory', which draws on the work of several philosophers, Garry Watson argues that Lawrence is not better known as a theorist today because of the language he used and the shift that has occurred in our view of politics, advocating that, particularly in *The Rainbow* and *Women in Love*, Lawrence's thinking is perhaps more "theory in progress" than theory (318).

Finally, readers are treated to two further essays that consider Lawrence's creative legacy; Louis K. Greiff draws on his extensive knowledge of the subject to offer a chapter on 'Film Adaptations', while Lee M. Jenkins writes a detailed and informative account of 'Lawrence's Influence on Later Writers'. Arguing that Lawrence "has been a missing link in histories of the English working-class novel" (329), Jenkins discusses the effect Lawrence had on a wide range of other poets and novelists, on both sides of the Atlantic.

The sheer volume and variety of the chapters in this book is testament to Harrison's success in his ambition to present a new, clearer and, importantly, more nuanced image of Lawrence. This volume should engage anyone who has even a passing interest in Lawrence. For scholars of his work, it provides an essential point of reference.

Susan Reid, *D. H. Lawrence, Music and Modernism*.
Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.
Pp. 260. £59.99 (hardcover). ISBN 978 3 0300 4998 0

Reviewed by Bethan Jones

As Susan Reid is keen to emphasise in her ground-breaking monograph, the subject of Lawrence and music has long been neglected or misrepresented. Reid attributes this in part to Lawrence's preference for small-scale musical works – the song over the symphony – which runs counter to the trend evident within many of his literary modernist contemporaries. (She also distinguishes Lawrence, Nietzsche and Carpenter from the

‘Wagnerite’ modernists Ford Madox Ford, E. M. Forster and Virginia Woolf [7].) Yet the scope of Reid’s study indicates how such distinctions are overly simplistic, failing to acknowledge the significance of music to Lawrence and the depth of his engagement with an art form that shaped many aspects of his life and work.

This book is impressively wide-ranging. In terms of Lawrence’s own writing, Reid principally tackles poetry (early poems, ‘All of Us’, *Bay*); novels (*The White Peacock*, *The Trespasser*, *The Rainbow*, *Women in Love*, *Aaron’s Rod*, *The Plumed Serpent*); and drama (*David*). These are the texts foregrounded in chapter titles, but in reality the scope is broader still. For instance, in several chapters Reid alludes to Lawrence’s essay ‘Art and the Individual’ (1908) as this non-fictional piece furnishes crucial insights into Lawrence’s views on music. She also draws frequently on relevant correspondence, leaving short fiction and novellas as the only literary genres that are rarely mentioned.

The introductory chapter is indicative of the way Reid seamlessly navigates her way through a number of fascinatingly complex debates about referential and non-referential modes of expression in the modernist period. This discussion hinges on a debate among philosophers, writers, artists and musicians about the nature of “absolute” or purely instrumental music (1) and the extent to which this became an ideal for the arts. Lawrence’s perspective is contextualised through reference to Pater, Schopenhauer, Woolf, Joyce, Pound, Eliot, Yeats, Murry, Nietzsche, Mann, Beethoven, Debussy, Stravinsky, Schoenberg, Hanslick and Chladni. Reid points to Lawrence’s early preference for “parlour music” (such as the works of Chopin) and a rejection of Wagner’s operatic extravagance (7), whilst also highlighting an ambivalence in Lawrence’s attitude to the latter. Chapter 3 develops these ideas through considering the significance of Bizet’s *Carmen* to *The White Peacock* in conjunction with the Wagnerian influence on *The Trespasser*. Debussy and Nietzsche are considered as influential contemporaries who responded negatively to aspects of Wagner’s style.

While *The Trespasser* is often acknowledged as a “musical” novel (though rarely discussed with this degree of detailed attention), *The Rainbow*’s prose is commonly accepted as strongly rhythmic or incantatory. Yet Reid’s analysis of this turn to rhythm takes our understanding to a new level through reference to explicitly musical connections. Her comparison of this novel with Schoenberg’s *Jakobsleiter* is particularly astute, shedding new light on the key chapter ‘The Cathedral’ and Lawrence’s recurrent combining of the sacred and the profane. The following chapter explores polyphonic elements in *Women in Love* in relation to a range of composers including Wagner, Stravinsky and Holst, with particular emphasis on the latter’s *The Planets*, in which the ending of the movement ‘Neptune’, which fades into silence, is used to exemplify modernist “absolute music” as discussed earlier. Reid considers the representation of Gerald as a “sick Tristan” figure (15) but also indicates ways in which folk-song elements are introduced in the novel, counter-balancing the Wagnerian influence.

Chapter 6 further testifies to the originality of Reid’s study, foregrounding a frequently marginalised novel (*Aaron’s Rod*), a rather neglected book of war poems (*Bay*) and another poetry collection (‘All of Us’) that has only been widely available since its recent publication within Christopher Pollnitz’s three-volume *Poems* edition. The First World War is a crucial context here and Reid highlights Lawrence’s movement away from “noisy” large-scale works, such as Wagner’s, towards less monolithic forms, such as the music of Scarlatti or Schubert’s song cycle *Winterreise*. A fascinating strand here is the representation of Egypt. In *The Poems*, Pollnitz alludes to Lawrence’s translation of a volume of Egyptian (Fellaheen) folk songs, some of which he sent to Louie Burrows in December 1910 in place of love poems (IL 196) – then later reworked in ‘All of Us’. Here Reid contrasts the Imperialist agenda of Verdi’s *Aida* (depicted with “disgust” in *Aaron’s Rod*) with Lawrence’s songlike evocation of the Fellaheen workers in his war poems, which also reflect their involvement in a conflict

between western powers. In her discussion of the *Bay* poems, Reid interestingly compares the literally chilling ‘Winter-Lull’ with Debussy’s *Berceuse Héroïque* – an apt example of the way literature and music are constantly and constructively juxtaposed.

Chapter 7 serves as an appropriate culmination of the main chapters through considering a novel explicitly containing songs (*The Plumed Serpent*) and the only text for which Lawrence produced a musical score (*David*). In a sense, this section develops material from Chapter 2 in which Reid has considered the influence of non-conformist hymns assimilated in Lawrence’s youth and discussed in his late essay ‘Hymns in a Man’s Life’ (1928). Here, though, the emphasis is on Native American music (such as drumming and piping) heard by Lawrence particularly in New Mexico, and which impacted on the musical sketches he incorporated in his Biblical play. The novel and play are linked through their “staginess” (189) and *David* is insightfully considered in relation to Pound’s *Le Testament de Villon*. A further intertext is introduced through reference to Handel’s oratorio *Saul*, in which the eponymous protagonist becomes the tragic hero, just as, in *David*, the emotional intensity of the play hinges on the fate of Saul. This last full-length chapter ends by touching on *Lady Chatterley’s Lover* and the near-absence of music from Lawrence’s last novel.

The concluding section indicates how Huxley’s portrayal of Lawrence in *Point Counter Point* trivialises – or at least satirises – Lawrence’s response to music. Reid acknowledges that Huxley is right in indicating Lawrence’s ultimate preference for song over symphony, but wrong in dismissing him as a result – instead, she argues, there is potential for a further book on the way modernists in general assimilated song in their literary works. This is not quite the end, however, as the conclusion is followed by an Afterword, which is in turn followed by an Appendix. The Afterword discusses the (neglected) song-cycle *Man Who Has Come Through* in which Anthony Burgess sets four Lawrence poems to music, while the Appendix provides an incredibly thorough and useful list of other

musical settings of Lawrence's works, composed between 1914 and the present day. I have already found this Appendix invaluable in my own research in this area.

The monograph is densely but accessibly written with well-linked sections and a clear trajectory. It is packed with fascinating material – the only slight caveat being that in rare moments it is possible to lose the argumentative thread due to its sheer breadth and range. The combining of literary and musicological analysis is skilfully handled; where musical examples are provided and discussed, these are not presented in a way that would deter an inexpert reader. Reid has achieved something really important – and long overdue – in this book. Scholars of Lawrence and modernism alike are now well equipped to situate him as a writer for whom music was an absolute, defining inspiration and a key element within his works.

John Worthen, *Young Frieda*.
London: Jetstone, 2019.
Pp. 192. £10.00 (paperback). ISBN 978 1 9108 5815 8

Reviewed by Neil Roberts

I have met only two men who knew Frieda Lawrence. In both cases she was an old woman at the time and the men were much younger than her. But in both cases I felt that they were in some way in love with her.

John Worthen's new book suggests that he would not be surprised by this. The title does not merely indicate that the book covers Frieda's early years (in fact the narrative takes us up to Lawrence's death and beyond) but that she was, in words that the author attributes to her, "forever young" (91).

Young Frieda is not a biography; but nor, though it is a work of fiction, is it exactly a novel. Worthen states that he had earlier attempted and abandoned a biography of Frieda because of the lack